

Name: _____ DBQ: Mall Class: _____

My DBQ Checklist

This document is to be completed by the author of the DBQ.

DO NOT give yourself a check unless you have met each specific requirement exactly.

I have an acceptable thesis (an argument) that **directly** addresses the **question**.
Remember: There is no wrong answer! Just back up your thesis with evidence!!!

I used _____ out of _____ documents (**Must use all or all but one**).

I addressed (answered) **all** parts of the question.

I demonstrated my understanding of the documents by using them to support my thesis using evidence from the documents.

I have analyzed bias or point of view in _____ # of documents (**at least 3**).

I have organized the documents into _____ groups. Each group must have a minimum of two (2) documents (**at least 3 groups**).

I have identified at least one additional **specific** document that would be helpful.

I did the following additional tasks (in-depth analysis, compare/contrast different points of view, explanation of bias within a document, etc.) to earn the 1-2 extra points:

I believe that my score on this DBQ is a _____ out of a possible 9 points.

Please staple this to the front of your essay.

Teachers comments:

Name: _____ Date: _____ Class: _____

DBQ #1 – Developing groups and analyzing Point of View

Directions: The following question is based on the accompanying Documents 1–9. This question is designed to test your ability to work with and understand historical documents. Write a five paragraph essay that:

- Has a relevant thesis and supports that thesis with evidence from the documents.
- Uses all or all but one of the documents.
- Analyzes the documents by grouping them in as many appropriate ways as possible. Does not simply summarize the documents individually.
- Takes into account both the sources of the documents and the authors' points of view.

Compare and contrast the views held by the people documented in the quotes below. Based on the documents, draw a conclusion or conclusions about the cause and outcome of the events that took place at the Morgantown Mall last Friday night. What additional type of document(s) would help assess the actual events of this incident?

BACKGROUND INFORMATION: On Friday, September 16, two girls from a local area middle school were involved in an altercation in the food court area of the Morgantown Mall. I was not present to witness the events as they unfolded. However, upon returning to school Monday morning, all the students were talking about “the fight” and “what went down” at the Mall last Friday night. **What I want to know is what REALLY happened and why.** Throughout the day, I spoke with witnesses and consulted the local newspaper in an attempt to obtain the truth. As I review each source, I must constantly ask myself, “What is the validity of each person’s comment(s)?” and “What is their particular point of view regarding the incident.”

DOCUMENT 1

Michael Woodall, Newspaper Reporter, *The Dominion Post*

A small altercation broke out in the food court of the Morgantown Mall Friday evening between two minors, both of whom were female. Names are not being released at this time. After a brief scuffle, a soda machine at the *Chick-fil-A* was knocked on the ground and subsequently broken. The *Chick-fil-A* cow mascot was present at the time and also got knocked to the ground. The mascot went to the emergency room and was treated and released with minor lacerations.

(note: most small incidents are phoned in by mall security officers or interpreted through police reports)

DOCUMENT 2

Alan Mitchell, Manager of *Chick-fil-A*

I can't believe this! How am I going to explain this to the corporate office? Now I will have to pay for a new soda machine! What were those girls thinking? Both of them are to blame! This is going to kill my profits. Our cow mascot had nothing to do with this! He is just a scape goat for those immature, badly behaving girls and their irresponsible parents. Someone will pay!

DOCUMENT 3

Will Jordan, *Chick-Fil-A* Cow Mascot on Friday, September 16

I don't know, man. It was hot in that suit! Plus, it is really hard to see with that gigantic head on. All I know is one minute I was standing there passing out balloons to the kids, the next I was on the floor behind the counter with a soda machine on top of me. It was out of control. My manager told me it was those middle school girls. I am thinking about getting a lawyer. Those girls are so gonna get it.

DOCUMENT 4

Chloe Martin, student at South Middle School

My mom is so angry at me! I really don't know what happened. I know that everyone said that Fiona and I were fighting, but that's not true! We were just joking! We went up to get a balloon from the *Chick-Fil-A* Cow Mascot. We started "fighting" over the balloon, you know, play pushing and shoving each other. Then, the cow mascot started to wobble back and forth. That cow ran in to us...then he just fell backwards, flipping over the counter and taking the soda machine with him.

DOCUMENT 5

Jeffrey Meadows, Principal of South Middle School

I know both Chloe and Fiona. They have always been such good girls and solid "A" students. I always thought that they were friends. Fighting at the mall! I don't know. They are both on the Cross Country team. I hope this doesn't affect the morale of the team.

DOCUMENT 6

Joe Johnson, Witness who was eating in the food court at the time.

I saw everything! I was eating those sugar cinnamon pretzel nuggets from Auntie Anne's. They are so good! I saw Chloe and Fiona pushing and shoving each other. Fiona looked really mad. They were standing right next to that stupid cow. Fiona had a balloon in her hand. Fiona shoved Chloe really hard and she went flying! At the same time, that cow started stumbling backwards. That flip thing he did over the counter was pretty funny. Is the cow OK?

DOCUMENT 7

Jill Moore, mother of Fiona Moore

What can I say? Although I am disappointed in my daughter for "play" fighting, she didn't do anything wrong. The girls said neither one of them ever touched that cow. They said he just started swaying and then fell backwards. I will NOT let my daughter's name get dragged through the mud for something that she didn't do!

DOCUMENT 8

Owen Dyson, *Chick-Fil-A* employee working the register on Friday evening.

I...I'm just not sure. I mean, everything happened so fast! I saw those two girls pushing and shoving each other right in front of the cow. One of them was smiling. She was kind of cute. It was all I could do to move out of the way when the cow and soda machine landed behind the counter. I just don't want to get in trouble with my manager. I need this job.

DOCUMENT 9

Robert Benson, Security Guard, Morgantown Mall. Excerpt from his report.

Two young teenage females began to exchange words in front of the *Chick-Fil-A*. The altercation quickly became physical. The *Chick-Fil-A* Cow Mascot was pushed hard and flipped behind the counter with the soda machine on top of him. I was the first responder and arrived within minutes. I pulled the soda machine off the cow, removed his head and began to give him first aid. He was sweating profusely and seemed disoriented. Meanwhile, the *Chick-Fil-A* manager called 911. I detained the two girls, took their personal information, and questioned them regarding the incident.

*** This scenario and accounts contained within are all fictional. Any similarity to actual events is purely coincidental. All names have been used with permission.**

Thesis: _____

Group 1: _____

Group 2: _____

Group 3: _____

Additional document(s): _____

Conclusion / Summary / Restatement of Thesis: _____

Document Based Question

8th grade example

On Friday, September 16, two girls from South Middle School engaged in an argument at the food court of the Morgantown Mall. The argument quickly turned into a fight, and the Chick-Fil-A cow mascot was knocked over. He flipped behind the counter and took the soda machine with him. Nine people were interviewed about the accident. Some of the interviewees were present; others were not. The girls were not part of the cow's mishap. He merely fell over because the suit was hot and he was passing out.

Group 1 contains Documents 2, 3, and 8 because all of those are biased towards Chick-Fil-A. Chick-Fil-A is trying to shift the blame away from their store because they don't want to have to pay the cost of a new soda machine. Document 2 is the outraged response of the nervous manager, who badmouthed the girls and their families. Document 3 is the cow's response. He says that the suit was really hot, stuffy, and hard to see out of. He doesn't really know much about this incident, but is basing his reaction on the reaction of his manager. Document 8 is the cashier's explanation of what happened. He offered little in the way of details, sounded quite shifty, and was mostly just checking out the two girls, but he said they were smiling, which leads us to believe that they were not actually fighting.

Group 2 contains Documents 4, 5, and 7 because all of them are biased towards the girls. They are trying to shift the blame away from themselves so that they don't give their school a bad name and don't have to pay the cost of a new soda machine. Document 4 is Chloe's story. She is biased because she wants to stay out of trouble with her mother, who is angry at her. She says that she and Fiona were merely play-fighting and did not have anything to do with the cow. The cow just wobbled over in their direction and then fell backward over the counter. Document 5 is Mr. Meadows's argument, that the girls have always been model students. However, he was

not there when the incident occurred. He is just trying to put his school in a good light.

Document 7 is Fiona's mother, who also does not have a very good argument. She is basing her story on what Fiona told her, and as middle school students often lie to escape trouble, she is not a reliable source.

Group 3 contains Documents 1, 6, and 9 because they contain no bias. Document 1 is merely a repetition of the backstory created by a newspaper reporter. It does not clarify who did it. Document 6 is the account from a witness of the incident. He was mainly focused on the food he was eating, but he said that the girls fighting seemed like a totally separate event from the cow mascot toppling backwards over the counter. Document 9 is the account of the Morgantown Mall security guard. He was not there to witness the event and is mostly focused on his actions and not what happened.

The girls, Joe Johnson (the bystander), the cashier, and the mascot himself provide ample evidence that the two girls had nothing to do with the toppling cow. They may have been actually fighting, but the cow fell because he passed out. The cashier is clearly withholding information because he doesn't want to lose his job, which leads to the possible conclusion that there was some piece of evidence that would work against Chick-Fil-A and that the manager is making everyone keep quiet about it. One additional document that would be extremely helpful would be security tapes from the Morgantown Mall security camera.